Impact of Wind Turbines on Market Value of Texas Rural Land

Gardner Appraisal Group Inc.
Derry T. Gardner
147 E. Mistletoe Avenue
San Antonio, TX 78212
www.GardnerAppraisalGroup.com
Prepared for the South Texas Plains Agriculture
Wind & Wildlife Conference
February 13, 2009
American Wind Power Center & Museum,
Lubbock, Texas
Will a wind turbine affect my property value?
WILL A WIND TURBINE ON MY PROPERTY AFFECT THE MARKET VALUE OF MY NEIGHBOR’S PROPERTY?
WOULD YOU PAY THE SAME PRICE FOR THIS LAND _AFTER_ WIND FARM AS _BEFORE_ WIND FARM?

_Before_  

_After_
Do you know how big they really are?

- Utility Pole: 30 ft.
- Transmission Tower: 125 ft.
- Wind Turbine: up to 550 ft.
- Forest Tree: 60 ft.
THIS IS HOW BIG THEY ARE!

- 70 metre Diameter
- Blade – 35 metres
- Base height 60 metres
- Boeing 747 Jumbo Jet Span 59.6m Length 70.5m
- 95 metres
When valuing real property, first determine the property rights to be appraised; the most complete form of ownership is "title in fee" or FEE SIMPLE INTEREST

- Most complete form of ownership
- Unencumbered by any other interest or estate
- Only subject to limitations imposed by the government (taxation, eminent domain, police power, escheat)
Ownership of a fee simple interest = ownership of the complete bundle of rights;

Each right represents a partial interest in the whole
Real property ownership includes a bundle of rights – each with a value:
- right to sell/lease/mortgage an interest
- right to occupy the property
- right to convey
- right to do nothing at all

Unlike mineral rights, Texas is undecided as to "wind rights" – can they be conveyed? can they be retained?
Market forces create value; same market forces have a bearing on the **HIGHEST AND BEST USE OF LAND**

**HIGHEST AND BEST USE MEANS** the use of the property that results in the highest value that is also:

- **LEGAL**;
- **REASONABLY PROBABLE**;
- **PHYSICALLY POSSIBLE**; and
- **FINANCIALLY FEASIBLE**

**HIGHEST AND BEST USE IS THE FOUNDATION UPON WHICH MARKET VALUE RESTS**
IN THE PAST 25 YEARS THE HIGHEST & BEST USE OF TEXAS RANGELAND HAS CHANGED FROM AGRICULTURAL USE TO RECREATIONAL USE

TAYLOR COUNTY HUNTING (RECREATIONAL) LEASES BRING $12.00 TO $18.00 PER ACRE... COMPARED TO GRAZING LEASES BRING $2.50 TO $3.50 PER ACRE...

RECREATIONAL USE INCLUDES:
HUNTING, FISHING, CAMPING, HIKING, etc... WILDLIFE RESOURCES & CONSERVATION, LIVE WATER, WEEKEND PLACE, PEACE & QUIET
DIRECT SALES COMPARISON APPROACH;
MOST WIDELY USED AND ACCEPTED
APPROACH TO VALUING RURAL PROPERTY

• Defined as an estimate of value of recent
  sales of similar property in the surrounding
  or competing areas – as compared to the
  subject property
PROPERTY CHARACTERISTICS NECESSARY FOR THE COMPARISON

- Property rights conveyed
- Financing of the purchase
- Conditions of sale
- Market conditions over time
- Mineral interests
- Improvements
- Size/Shape
- Physical Characteristics
- Live Water
- Fencing
- Location/Access
- Views
NOT COMPARABLE

RESIDENCE

RURAL
PAIRED SALES ANALYSIS

Within the direct sales comparison approach - several techniques are used to quantify adjustments - most commonly used technique is that of paired sales:

When two properties are in all other respects equal, a single difference can be measured to determine the difference in price between the two.
TWO TRUCKS – BOTH FORDS; BOTH F-150; BOTH FOUR WHEEL DRIVE; BOTH 2009 MODELS – ONE DIFFERENCE LARIAT PKG VS KING RANCH PKG

LARIAT $36,000.00

KING RANCH $45,000.00
COMPARING THESE TWO TRUCKS UNDER PAIRED SALES TECHNIQUE:

KING RANCH PKGE CONTRIBUTES $9,000 IN VALUE OVER THE LARIAT PKGE
PAIRED SALES TECHNIQUE
is used in determining the value of:

- Undivided interests (multiple owners of property)
- Conservation easements
- Burned Property (due to wildfires, grassfires)
- Presence of Power Lines & Transmission lines
- Presence/view shed of wind turbines
- Other property conditions
WHAT WE KNOW ABOUT WIND TURBINES
common sense stuff

- Up to 600 feet tall
- Constant noise
- Shadow/flicker
- View shed effect – turbines tower over horizon, changing the view
- Construction; transmission lines; substations
- Turbines forever change the aesthetics; a more industrial feeling
- Loss of native wildlife habitat
Findings:
wind turbines will not diminish Property Values, but will enhance Property Values

Flaws:
1. funded by proponents of wind power built in bias in conclusions...
2. methodology used lacks necessary variables for analysis...
VARIABLES NOT USED IN REPP

• Rising or falling market
• # of days from listing to sale
• Residential property; not rural property
• Did not take into account effect of noise, flickering, shadow
• Does not factor in distances....
• Possible change in Highest and Best Use because of presence of wind turbine...
Appraisal Research Shows:

• A **VIEW adds value** to rural property
• Take **view away** – added **value goes away**
• Brokers in rural areas confirm that property values in areas of wind facilities are 10% – 30% **less** than property not in areas of wind facilities.
• Wind energy development creates an income stream, increasing property’s production value; increased production value does not necessarily result in increased market value
Case Study One - 2007

- 350 acres in Erath County – top end ranch purchased for retirement homestead....
- 27 wind turbines within 1 ½ mile radius
- For sale for $2,100,000.00
- Prospective buyer agreed to sales price
- Disclosure of wind turbine project to buyer
- Buyer backed out of offer
- Seller agreed to 25% discount to Buyer
- Buyer declined discounted offer
- Currently little interest in property in spite of other characteristics of property
Case Study Two - 2007

- **Using paired sales analysis** - Sales of Seven large tracts of rural land with varying proximity to wind turbines in Taylor County, Texas.
- Sales 1, 2, and 3 compared to Sales 4-7
- Sales occurred between 3-06 & 8-07
- No time adjustment
- Contributory value of improvements deducted from each sale
- All other characteristics considered similar
## Wind turbine on the property

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sale Number</th>
<th>Wind Turbine Presence (western Taylor County; 1700+ acres; 3 wind turbines on property; seller reserved “wind rights”)</th>
<th>Price/Acre</th>
<th>Diminution Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>One</td>
<td>Turbines on property</td>
<td>$850.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four</td>
<td>No wind turbines in visual range</td>
<td>$1,290.00</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Five</td>
<td>No wind turbines in visual range</td>
<td>$1,536.00</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Six</td>
<td>No wind turbines in visual range</td>
<td>$1,200.00</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seven</td>
<td>No wind turbines in visual range</td>
<td>$1,416.00</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TURBINES ON PROPERTY

Diminution in value

29%–45%

37% average
# Wind turbine within .2 - .4 miles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sale Number</th>
<th>Wind Turbine Presence</th>
<th>Price/Acre</th>
<th>Diminution Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Two</td>
<td>Turbines within .2 - .4 miles</td>
<td>$1,000.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four</td>
<td>No wind turbines in visual range</td>
<td>$1,290.00</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Five</td>
<td>No wind turbines in visual range</td>
<td>$1,536.00</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Six</td>
<td>No wind turbines in visual range</td>
<td>$1,200.00</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seven</td>
<td>No wind turbines in visual range</td>
<td>$1,416.00</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TURBINES WITHIN .2 - .4 MILES

Diminution in value is 17%-35%

26% Average
# Wind turbine within 1.8 miles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sale Number</th>
<th>Wind Turbine Presence (550+ acres in Taylor County, 1 turbine 1.8 miles away)</th>
<th>Price/Acre</th>
<th>Diminution Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Three</td>
<td>Turbines within 1.8 miles</td>
<td>$1,016.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four</td>
<td>No wind turbines in visual range</td>
<td>$1,290.00</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Five</td>
<td>No wind turbines in visual range</td>
<td>$1,536.00</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Six</td>
<td>No wind turbines in visual range</td>
<td>$1,200.00</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seven</td>
<td>No wind turbines in visual range</td>
<td>$1,416.00</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TURBINES WITHIN 1.8 MILES

Diminution in value is 15%-34%

25% Average
Diminution in Value Summary

Turbines on property
  Average 37%

Turbines within .2 -.4 miles
  Average 26%

Turbines within 1.8 miles
  Average 25%
Possible Additional Diminution in Value

Additional 15% - 25% diminution in value of property due to the following:
WIND TURBINE INFRASTRUCTURE -
HIGH POWER TRANSMISSION LINES
SUBSTATIONS
ADDITIONAL TRAFFIC FOR SERVICE OF WIND TURBINE AND POWER LINES
ADDITIONAL ROADS
Market Data and common sense tell us property values are negatively impacted by the presence of wind turbines.
Consider & weigh impact on your property’s overall value when leasing for wind turbines...
THE BIG QUESTION

- Does increased income from wind turbine offset the potential decrease in market value?
IN SOME SITUATIONS, IT WILL, IN OTHERS IT WILL NOT...

MAKE AN INFORMED DECISION WITH A VIEW TO THE FUTURE OWNERSHIP OF THE PRECIOUS RESOURCE OF LAND...
Studies Developed by:

- Gardner Appraisal Group, Inc.
- Austin Valuation Consultants
- Various real estate appraisers and brokers
This report was prepared for a presentation given at the South Plains Agriculture Wind & Wildlife Conference, in Lubbock, Texas, dated February 13, 2009. The findings and conclusions contained herein are the exclusive property of Gardner Appraisal Group, Inc., and cannot be reproduced without the express written permission of Gardner Appraisal Group, Inc.

The contents of this presentation are subject to the following conditions and to such other limiting conditions set forth herein:

• information, estimates & opinions furnished to the authors of the presentation herein and relied upon in reaching the conclusions, judgments or decisions contained herein, were obtained from sources considered reliable and believed to be true & correct. However the authors herein assume no responsibility for the accuracy of said sources.

• the author’s expertise is in the valuation of real property. No responsibility is assumed for any detrimental conditions which may exist in the sales data, or for any studies or expertise required to discover same.

GARDNER APPRAISAL GROUP, INC.
DERRY T. GARDNER
210-737-1321
www.gardnerappraisalgroup.com