

Brown County Board of Health Resolution Requesting Emergency State Aid for Families Suffering Around Industrial Wind Turbines

WHEREAS the Public Service Commission of Wisconsin's wind siting rules ('PSC 128') were created without oversight of a medical professional "...who is a University of Wisconsin System faculty member with expertise regarding the health impacts of wind energy systems." as mandated in 2009 WISCONSIN ACT 40. Jevon D. McFadden, MD, MPH (the Medical Doctor appointed to this role) publically acknowledged that he did not meet these criteria.

WHEREAS in the May 25, 2010 presentation made by Jevon D. McFadden, MD, MPH to the Brown County Board of Health, on behalf of the Wisconsin Department of Health Services - Division of Public Health, the State recognized and acknowledged that "*Gaps remain in our knowledge of the impact that wind energy may have on human health...*" but has failed to take any action to fill these gaps.

WHEREAS the Public Service Commission of Wisconsin's wind siting rules ('PSC 128') were suspended on March 1, 2011 by the Joint Committee for Review of Administrative Rules (JCRAR) stating that its contents "...create an emergency relating to public health, safety, or welfare; are arbitrary and capricious; and impose an undue hardship on landowners and residents adjacent to wind turbine sites."

WHEREAS the State of Wisconsin has failed to remedy this "*emergency relating to public health, safety, or welfare*" by carrying out the mandate of 2009 WISCONSIN ACT 40 which requires the State to enact wind siting standards that "...include setback requirements that provide reasonable protection from any health effects, including health effects from noise and shadow flicker, associated with wind energy systems..."

WHEREAS the State's inaction to enact wind siting rules that protect human health and safety has allowed development of the industrial wind project known as Shirley Wind LLC to be constructed in the Town of Glenmore, Brown County, Wisconsin (dedicated November 2010).

WHEREAS Shirley Wind LLC has created an environment that has resulted in the very same "*undue hardships*" that the JCRAR suspension of 'PSC 128' sought to prevent. These "*undue hardships*" have forced two families to vacate their homes to regain their health and continue to force at least two other families to suffer adverse health effects significant enough that they seek refuge away from their homes but do not have the financial ability to temporarily relocate.

WHEREAS the Brown County Board of Health has attached recent (2009 and newer) references (many peer-reviewed) to this resolution, organized by year of publication, accurately describing the cause, conditions, and adverse health effects being experienced by Brown County families.

WHEREAS the Brown County Board of Health has in the past, and continues to, advocate for the health and safety of Brown County families.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Brown County Board of Health formally requests temporary emergency financial relocation assistance from the State of Wisconsin for those Brown County families that are suffering adverse health effects and undue hardships caused by the irresponsible placement of industrial wind turbines around their homes and property. The State of Wisconsin emergency financial assistance is requested until the conditions that have caused these undue hardships are studied and resolved, allowing these families to once again return safely to their homes and property.

Brown County Board of Health
Industrial Wind Turbine Health Impact Supporting References

The following recent (2009 and newer) references (many peer-reviewed), organized by year of publication, accurately describe the cause, conditions, and adverse health effects being experienced by Brown County families.

2012:

Barbara J Frey, BA, MA (University of Minnesota), Peter J Hadden, BSc (Est Man) FRICS, Wind Turbines And Proximity To Homes: The Impact Of Wind Turbine Noise On Health, **January, 2012**.
http://docs.wind-watch.org/Frey_Hadden_WT_noise_health_01Jan2012.pdf

2011:

Stephen E. Ambrose, INCE (Brd. Cert.), Robert W. Rand, INCE Member, The Bruce McPherson Infrasound and Low Frequency Noise Study - Adverse Health Effects Produced By Large Industrial Wind Turbines Confirmed, **December 14, 2011**.
<http://randacoustics.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/12/The-Bruce-McPherson-ILFN-Study.pdf>

Carmen M.E. Krogh, BScPharm, Brett S. Horner, BA, CMA, "A summary of new evidence: Adverse health effects and industrial wind turbines", **August 2011**.
<http://www.windaction.org/documents/32829>

Krogh, C. M. E., "Industrial wind turbine development and loss of social justice?" *Bulletin of Science Technology & Society*, **August 2011** vol. 31 no. 4 pages 321-333.
<http://bst.sagepub.com/content/31/4/321>

Daniel Shepherd, David McBride, David Welch, Kim N. Dirks, Erin M. Hill, "Evaluating the impact of wind turbine noise on health-related quality of life," *Noise & Health*, **September 2011** vol. 13 issue 54 pages 333-339.
<http://www.noiseandhealth.org/article.asp?issn=1463-1741;year=2011;volume=13;issue=54;spage=333;epage=339;aulast=Shepherd>

Bronzaft, A. L., "The Noise from wind turbines: Potential adverse impacts on children's well-being," *Bulletin of Science Technology & Society*, **August 2011** vol. 31 no. 4 pages 291-295.
<http://bst.sagepub.com/content/31/4/291>

McMurtry, R. Y., "Toward a case definition of adverse health effects in the environs of industrial wind turbines: Facilitating a clinical diagnosis," *Bulletin of Science Technology & Society*, **August 2011** vol. 31 no. 4 pages 316-320.
<http://bst.sagepub.com/content/31/4/316>

Environmental Review Tribunal, Case Nos.: 10-121/10-122 Erickson v. Director, Ministry of the Environment, Jerry V. DeMarco, Panel Chair and Paul Muldoon, Vice-Chair, **July 2011**
<http://www.ert.gov.on.ca/files/201108/00000300-AKT5757C7CO026-BHH51C7A7SO026.pdf>

Harrison, J. P., "Wind turbine noise," *Bulletin of Science Technology & Society*, **August 2011** vol. 31 no. 4 pages 256-261.
<http://bst.sagepub.com/content/31/4/256>

INCE/Europe, *Wind Turbine Noise 2011— Post conference report*, **April 2011**.
http://www.confweb.org/wtn2011/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=70:report&catid=35:information

Michael Nissenbaum MD, Jeff Aramini PhD, Chris Hanning MD, "Adverse health effects of industrial wind turbines: a preliminary report," *10th International Congress on Noise as a Public Health Problem*, **July 2011**.
http://www.healthywindwisconsin.com/Nissenbaum%20et%20al%20ICBEN2011_0158_final.pdf

2011 (continued):

Krogh, C. M. E., Gillis, L., Kouwen, N., and Aramini, J., "WindVOiCe, a self-reporting survey: adverse health effects, industrial wind turbines, and the need for vigilance monitoring," *Bulletin of Science Technology & Society*, **August 2011** vol. 31 no. 4 pages 334-345.

<http://bst.sagepub.com/content/31/4/334>

Laurie, S., "Submission to the Australian Federal Senate Inquiry on rural wind farms," by Dr. Sarah Laurie, BMBS, Medical Director Waubra Foundation, **February 2011**.

<http://docs.wind-watch.org/Laurie-Australia-Senate-submission-final.pdf>

Møller, H. & C. S. Pedersen, "Low-frequency noise from large wind turbines," *Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, **June 2011** vol. 129 no. 6 pages 3727-3744.

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1121/1.3543957>

Phillips, C. V., "Properly interpreting the epidemiologic evidence about the health effects of industrial wind turbines on nearby residents," *Bulletin of Science Technology & Society*, **August 2011**, vol. 31 no. 4, pages 303-315.

<http://bst.sagepub.com/content/31/4/303>

Richarz, W., Richarz, H., and Gambino, T., "Correlating very low frequency sound pulse to audible wind turbine sound," INCE/Europe Fourth International Meeting on Wind Turbine Noise, Rome Italy, 12-14 **April 2011**.

Cited in: <http://windconcernsontario.wordpress.com/2011/05/23/presentation-from-the-fourth-international-meeting-on-wind-turbine-noise/>

Salt, A. N. & Kaltenbach, J. A., "Infrasound From wind turbines could affect humans," *Bulletin of Science Technology & Society*, **August 2011** vol. 31 no. 4 pages 296-302.

<http://bst.sagepub.com/content/31/4/296>

Senate Standing Committees on Community Affairs (Parliament of Australia), "The social and economic impact of rural wind farms," **2011**.

http://www.aph.gov.au/senate/committee/clac_ctte/impact_rural_wind_farms/index.htm

Shain, M., "Public health ethics, legitimacy, and the challenges of industrial wind turbines: The Case of Ontario, Canada," *Bulletin of Science Technology & Society*, **August 2011** vol. 31 no. 4 pages 346-353.

<http://bst.sagepub.com/content/31/4/346>

Shepherd, D., McBride, D., Welch, D., Dirks, K., Hill, E., Wind turbine noise and health-related quality of life nearby residents: a cross-sectional study in New Zealand. Fourth International Meeting on Wind Turbine Noise. Rome Italy **April 2011**

http://www.maine.gov/dep/ftp/bep/ch375citizen_petition/pre-hearing/AR-30%20chapter%20375%20-%20r%20brown%20hearing%20submission%20-%20Shepherd%20et%20al%20Wind%20turbine%20noise%20%20Quality%20of%20Life%20Rome%202011.pdf

Thorne, B., "The Problems with 'noise numbers' for wind farm noise assessment," *Bulletin of Science Technology & Society*, **August 2011** vol. 31 no. 4 pages 262-290.

<http://bst.sagepub.com/content/31/4/262>

Vanderburg, W. H., "Assessing our ability to design and plan green energy technologies," *Bulletin of Science Technology & Society*, **August 2011** vol. 31 no. 4 pages 251-255

<http://bst.sagepub.com/content/31/4/251>

Oregon Health Authority, Oregon Public Health Division, Office of Environmental Public Health, "Health impacts of wind energy facilities," **2011**.

<http://public.health.oregon.gov/HealthyEnvironments/TrackingAssessment/HealthImpactAssessment/Pages/windenergy.aspx>

2010:

Chief Medical Officer of Health (of Ontario), Report: "The potential health impact of wind turbines," **May 2010**.

http://www.health.gov.on.ca/en/public/publications/ministry_reports/wind_turbine/wind_turbine.pdf

Hanning, C., "Wind turbine noise, sleep And health"—Summary paper prepared by Dr. Christopher Hanning. BSc, MB, BS, MRCS, LRCP, FRCA, MD, **November 2010**.

http://www.acousticceology.org/wind/winddocs/health/Hanning%202010_Wind%20turbine%20noise%20sleep%20and%20health%20November%202010.pdf

Ito, A. & T. Takeda, "Sickness claims prompt study of wind turbines [by the The Environment Ministry of Japan]," *The Asahi Simbun*, **January 2010**.

<http://www.asahi.com/english/TKY201001180410.html>

National Health and Medical Research Council (of Australia). "Wind turbines and health: a rapid review of the evidence," **2010**

<http://www.nhmrc.gov.au/publications/synopses/new0048.htm>

Nissenbaum, M., Press conference by Michael Nissenbaum, MD Radiologist in Vermont's State House, May 7, **2010**, (video).

<http://vimeo.com/11577982>

Pierpont, N., Letter to the Vermont State House of Representatives from Nina Pierpont, MD, PhD, Fellow of the American Academy of Pediatrics, Co-signed by the following:

- George Kamperman, PE, President, Kamperman Associates, Inc., Board-Certified Member of Institute of Noise Control Engineers, Fellow Member of Acoustical Society of America, Member of National Council of Acoustical Consultants,
- F. Owen Black, MD, Fellow of the American College of Surgeons, Board-Certified Otolaryngologist, Senior Scientist, Director of Neurotology Research Balance & Hearing Center North West, Legacy Health System
- Joel F. Lehrer, MD, Fellow of the American College of Surgeons, Board-Certified Otolaryngologist and Head and Neck Surgeon, Served on Hearing and Equilibrium Subcommittee of the American Academy of Otolaryngology and Head and Neck Surgery, Clinical Professor of Otolaryngology, University of Medicine & Dentistry of NJ,
- Stanley M. Shapiro, MD, Fellow of the American College of Cardiology, Board-Certified Internal Medicine, Cardiovascular Diseases, and Nuclear Cardiology, Champlain Valley Cardiovascular Associates,

February 2010.

<http://docs.wind-watch.org/Pierpont-et-al.-to-Klein-2-10-10.pdf>

Punch, J., James, R., & Pabst, D., (2010), "Wind-turbine noise: What audiologists should know," *Audiology Today*, **July-August 2010**.

<http://www.windaction.org/?module=uploads&func=download&fileId=2047>

Salt, A., "Infrasound: Your ears 'hear' it but they don't tell your brain"—Powerpoint presentation by Alec N. Salt, Ph.D., Department of Otolaryngology, (2010), Washington University School of Medicine, First International Symposium on Adverse Health and Wind Turbines, **Sept 2010**.

http://windvigilance.com/downloads/symposium2010/swv_symposium_presentation_infrasound_your_ears_hear_it_2.pdf

Salt, A. N. & Hullar, T. E., "Responses of the ear to low frequency sounds, infrasound and wind turbines," *Hearing Research*, **September 2010** vol. 268 nos. 1-2 pages 12-21.

<http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/20561575>

2010 (continued):

Thorne, R., "Assessing noise from wind farms,"—Powerpoint presentation by Robert Thorne, PhD in Health Science from Massey University, New Zealand for The Society for Wind Vigilance, First International Symposium, **October 2010**.

http://acousticecology.org/wind/winddocs/noise/swv_symposium_paper_thorne%20slides_assessing_noise_from_wind_farms%20copy.pdf

Thorne, R. (Noise Measurement Services), "Noise impact assessment report - Waubra Wind Farm," prepared by Robert Thorne, PhD in Health Science from Massey University, New Zealand, **July 2010**.

<http://docs.wind-watch.org/Dean-Waubra-Noise-Impact-July-20101.pdf>

2009:

Minnesota Department of Health, "Public health impacts of wind turbines"

<http://www.health.state.mn.us/divs/eh/hazardous/topics/windturbines.pdf>

World Health Organization, "Night noise guidelines for Europe."

http://www.euro.who.int/_data/assets/pdf_file/0017/43316/E92845.pdf